

2013 Workers' Compensation Commissioners Survey

Commissioner Susan S. Barden

Legal Skills

1. Knowledge and application of rule of evidence and procedural law: 141 responses
 - Excellent - 46.1%**
 - Good - 21.3%
 - Satisfactory - 24.8%
 - Deficient - 7.8%

2. Knowledge and application of substantive law: 143 responses
 - Excellent - 46.9%**
 - Good - 23.1%
 - Satisfactory - 21%
 - Deficient - 9.1%

3. Fair and effective settlement skills: 140 responses
 - Excellent - 30.7%
 - Good - 30%**
 - Satisfactory - 17.9%
 - Deficient - 21.4%

Impartiality

1. Absence of favoritism toward Claimant: 143 responses
 - Excellent - 50.3%**
 - Good - 21.7%
 - Satisfactory - 18.9%
 - Deficient - 9.1%

2. Absence of favoritism toward Defendants: 143 responses
 - Excellent - 32.2%**
 - Good - 19.6%
 - Satisfactory - 17.5%
 - Deficient - 30.8%

3. Not influenced by identities of lawyer: 140 responses
 - Excellent - 36.4%**
 - Good - 22.9%

Satisfactory - 26.4%

Deficient - 14.3%

4. Not influenced by identities of litigants: 139 responses

Excellent - 36.7%

Good - 25.2%

Satisfactory - 22.3%

Deficient - 15.8%

5. Avoidance of sexual, racial and ethnic bias: 141 responses

Excellent - 53.2%

Good - 19.1%

Satisfactory - 14.2%

Deficient - 13.5%

Judicial Temperament

1. Judicial temperament and demeanor in general: 141 responses

Excellent - 50.4%

Good - 19.9%

Satisfactory - 15.6%

Deficient - 14.2%

2. Courtesy to litigants and witnesses: 141 responses

Excellent - 57.4%

Good - 19.9%

Satisfactory - 15.6%

Deficient - 7.1%

3. Courtesy to lawyers: 140 responses

Excellent - 59.3%

Good - 19.3%

Satisfactory - 12.1%

Deficient - 9.3%

Industry and Promptness

1. Promptness in making judicial decisions: 142 responses

Excellent - 57.7%

Good - 22.5%

Satisfactory – 18.3%
Deficient – 1.4%

2. Punctuality and diligence: 141 responses

Excellent - 63.1%

Good - 19.1%

Satisfactory - 15.6%

Deficient - 1.4%

3. Fair and efficient trial management and docket control: 143 responses

Excellent - 56.3%

Good - 25.4%

Satisfactory - 12.7%

Deficient – 5.6%

Commissioner Scott Beck

Legal Skills

1. Knowledge and application of rule of evidence and procedural law: 131 responses

Excellent - 47.3%

Good - 32.1%

Satisfactory - 14.5%

Deficient - 6.1%

2. Knowledge and application of substantive law: 131 responses

Excellent - 45.8%

Good - 32.8%

Satisfactory - 16%

Deficient - 5.3%

3. Fair and effective settlement skills: 129 responses

Excellent - 38.0%

Good - 40.3%

Satisfactory - 12.4%

Deficient - 9.3%

Impartiality

1. Absence of favoritism toward Claimant: 131 responses

Excellent - 57.3%

Good - 26%

Satisfactory - 15.3%

Deficient - 1.5%

2. Absence of favoritism toward Defendants: 131 responses

Excellent - 37.4%

Good - 22.9%

Satisfactory - 19.8%

Deficient - 19.8%

3. Not influenced by identities of lawyer: 131 responses

Excellent - 45.8%

Good - 26.7%

Satisfactory - 19.8%

Deficient - 7.6%

4. Not influenced by identities of litigants: 131 responses

Excellent – 50.4%

Good - 26.7%

Satisfactory - 14.5%

Deficient - 8.4%

5. Avoidance of sexual, racial and ethnic bias: 128 responses

Excellent - 62.5%

Good - 18.8%

Satisfactory - 13.3%

Deficient - 5.6%

Judicial Temperament

1. Judicial temperament and demeanor in general: 131 responses

Excellent – 57.3%

Good - 22.9%

Satisfactory - 16%

Deficient - 3.8%

2. Courtesy to litigants and witnesses: 131 responses

Excellent - 66.4%

Good - 17.6%

Satisfactory - 13%

Deficient - 3.1%

3. Courtesy to lawyers: 131 responses

Excellent - 63.4%

Good - 21.4%

Satisfactory - 12.2%

Deficient - 3.1%

Industry and Promptness

1. Promptness in making judicial decisions: 131 responses

Excellent - 59.5%

Good - 26%

Satisfactory - 11.5%

Deficient - 3.1%

2. Punctuality and diligence: 131 responses

Excellent - 64.1%

Good - 20.6%

Satisfactory - 13%

Deficient - 2.3%

3. Fair and efficient trial management and docket control: 130 responses

Excellent - 63.8%

Good - 21.5%

Satisfactory - 11.5%

Deficient - 3.1%

Commissioner Melody James

Legal Skills

1. Knowledge and application of rule of evidence and procedural law: 48 responses
 - Excellent - 31.3%
 - Good - 47.9%**
 - Satisfactory - 16.7%
 - Deficient - 4.2%

2. Knowledge and application of substantive law: 47 responses
 - Excellent - 34%
 - Good - 42.6%**
 - Satisfactory - 19.1%
 - Deficient - 4.3%

3. Fair and effective settlement skills: 47 responses
 - Excellent - 27.7%
 - Good - 46.8%**
 - Satisfactory - 21.3%
 - Deficient - 4.3%

Impartiality

1. Absence of favoritism toward Claimant: 46 responses
 - Excellent - 34.8%
 - Good - 47.8%**
 - Satisfactory – 15.2%
 - Deficient - 2.2%

2. Absence of favoritism toward Defendants: 45 responses
 - Excellent - 31.1%
 - Good - 40%**
 - Satisfactory - 22.2%
 - Deficient - 6.7%

3. Not influenced by identities of lawyer: 45 responses
 - Excellent – 33.3%
 - Good - 44.4%**
 - Satisfactory - 17.8%
 - Deficient - 4.4%

4. Not influenced by identities of litigants: 45 responses
 - Excellent - 37.8%
 - Good - 42.2%**
 - Satisfactory - 15.6%
 - Deficient - 4.4%

5. Avoidance of sexual, racial and ethnic bias: 46 responses
 - Excellent - 41.3%
 - Good - 45.7%**
 - Satisfactory - 8.7%
 - Deficient - 4.3%

Judicial Temperament

1. Judicial temperament and demeanor in general: 47 responses
 - Excellent – 51.1%**
 - Good - 34%
 - Satisfactory 10.6%-
 - Deficient - 4.3%

2. Courtesy to litigants and witnesses: 46 responses
 - Excellent - 52.2%**
 - Good - 32.6%
 - Satisfactory - 10.9%
 - Deficient - 4.3%

3. Courtesy to lawyers: 45 responses
 - Excellent - 53.3%**
 - Good - 33.3%
 - Satisfactory - 8.9%
 - Deficient - 4.4%

Industry and Promptness

1. Promptness in making judicial decisions: 45 responses
 - Excellent - 37.8%
 - Good - 44.4%**
 - Satisfactory - 13.3%
 - Deficient – 4.4%

2. Punctuality and diligence: 46 responses

Excellent – 45.7%

Good - 37%

Satisfactory - 13%

Deficient - 4.3%

3. Fair and efficient trial management and docket control: 45 responses

Excellent - 35.6%

Good - 40%

Satisfactory - 15.6%

Deficient - 8.9%

Commissioner Gene McCaskill

Legal Skills

1. Knowledge and application of rule of evidence and procedural law: 75 responses

Excellent - 4%

Good - 8%

Satisfactory - 29.3%

Deficient - 58.7%

2. Knowledge and application of substantive law: 75 responses

Excellent - 5.3%

Good - 6.7%

Satisfactory - 30.7%

Deficient - 57.3%

3. Fair and effective settlement skills: 70 responses

Excellent - 8.6%

Good - 17.1%

Satisfactory - 40%

Deficient - 34.3%

Impartiality

1. Absence of favoritism toward Claimant: 72 responses

Excellent - 40.3%

Good - 30.6%

Satisfactory - 20.8%

Deficient - 8.3%

2. Absence of favoritism toward Defendants: 73 responses

Excellent - 21.9%

Good - 19.2%

Satisfactory - 20.5%

Deficient - 38.4%

3. Not influenced by identities of lawyer: 70 responses

Excellent - 25.7%

Good - 24.3%

Satisfactory - 35.7%

Deficient - 14.3%

4. Not influenced by identities of litigants: 72 responses
 - Excellent - 26.4%
 - Good - 20.8%
 - Satisfactory - 31.9%**
 - Deficient - 20.8%

5. Avoidance of sexual, racial and ethnic bias: 68 responses
 - Excellent - 42.6%**
 - Good - 19.1%
 - Satisfactory - 29.4%
 - Deficient - 8.8%

Judicial Temperament

1. Judicial temperament and demeanor in general: 75 responses
 - Excellent - 42.7%**
 - Good - 26.7%
 - Satisfactory - 24%
 - Deficient - 6.7%

2. Courtesy to litigants and witnesses: 75 responses
 - Excellent - 48%**
 - Good - 28%
 - Satisfactory - 21.3%
 - Deficient - 2.7%

3. Courtesy to lawyers: 70 responses
 - Excellent - 45.9%**
 - Good - 31.1%
 - Satisfactory - 20.3%
 - Deficient - 2.7%

Industry and Promptness

1. Promptness in making judicial decisions: 73 responses
 - Excellent - 27.4%
 - Good - 27.4%
 - Satisfactory - 35.6%**
 - Deficient - 9.6%

2. Punctuality and diligence: 74 responses

Excellent - 37.8%

Good - 25.7%

Satisfactory - 31.1%

Deficient - 5.4%

3. Fair and efficient trial management and docket control: 71 responses

Excellent - 32.4%

Good - 23.9%

Satisfactory - 33.8%

Deficient - 9.9%

Commissioner Andrea Roche

Legal Skills

1. Knowledge and application of rule of evidence and procedural law: 129 responses

Excellent - 77.5%

Good - 17.1%

Satisfactory - 3.1%

Deficient - 2.3%

2. Knowledge and application of substantive law: 129 responses

Excellent - 79.8%

Good - 14.7%

Satisfactory - 3.1%

Deficient - 2.3%

3. Fair and effective settlement skills: 126 responses

Excellent - 63.5%

Good - 23%

Satisfactory - 8.7%

Deficient - 4.8%

Impartiality

1. Absence of favoritism toward Claimant: 128 responses

Excellent - 55.5%

Good - 28.9%

Satisfactory 13.3%

Deficient - 2.3%

2. Absence of favoritism toward Defendants: 129 responses

Excellent - 45.7%

Good - 24.8%

Satisfactory - 15.5%

Deficient - 14%

3. Not influenced by identities of lawyer: 128 responses

Excellent - 43.8%

Good - 25%

Satisfactory - 21.9%

Deficient - 9.4%

4. Not influenced by identities of litigants: 129 responses

Excellent - 53.5%

Good - 24%

Satisfactory - 14%

Deficient - 8.5%

5. Avoidance of sexual, racial and ethnic bias: 128 responses

Excellent - 67.2%

Good - 17.2%

Satisfactory - 10.2%

Deficient - 5.5%

Judicial Temperament

1. Judicial temperament and demeanor in general: 129 responses

Excellent - 69%

Good - 17.1%

Satisfactory - 10.9%

Deficient - 3.1%

2. Courtesy to litigants and witnesses: 129 responses

Excellent - 70.5%

Good - 17.1%

Satisfactory - 10.1%

Deficient - 2.3%

3. Courtesy to lawyers: 129 responses

Excellent - 70.5%

Good - 17.1%

Satisfactory - 10.1%

Deficient - 2.3%

Industry and Promptness

1. Promptness in making judicial decisions: 129 responses

Excellent - 50.4%

Good - 24.8%

Satisfactory - 18.6%

Deficient - 6.2%

2. Punctuality and diligence: 129 responses

Excellent - 57.4%

Good - 26.4%

Satisfactory - 14%

Deficient - 2.3%

3. Fair and efficient trial management and docket control: 128 responses

Excellent - 53.9%

Good - 28.1%

Satisfactory - 14.1%

Deficient - 3.9%

Commissioner Avery Wilkerson, Jr.

Legal Skills

1. Knowledge and application of rule of evidence and procedural law: 122 responses
 - Excellent - 7.4%
 - Good - 21.3%
 - Satisfactory - 43.4%**
 - Deficient - 27.9%

2. Knowledge and application of substantive law: 123 responses
 - Excellent - 7.3%
 - Good - 22%
 - Satisfactory - 39%**
 - Deficient - 31.7%

3. Fair and effective settlement skills: 118 responses
 - Excellent - 18.6%
 - Good - 31.4%
 - Satisfactory - 38.1%**
 - Deficient - 11.9%

Impartiality

1. Absence of favoritism toward Claimant: 122 responses
 - Excellent - 38.5%**
 - Good - 34.4%
 - Satisfactory - 21.3%
 - Deficient - 5.7%

2. Absence of favoritism toward Defendants: 121 responses
 - Excellent - 20.7%
 - Good - 25.6%
 - Satisfactory - 33.1%**
 - Deficient - 20.7%

3. Not influenced by identities of lawyer: 122 responses
 - Excellent - 18.9%
 - Good - 27.9%
 - Satisfactory - 36.1%**
 - Deficient - 17.2%

4. Not influenced by identities of litigants: 122 responses
 - Excellent - 24.6%
 - Good - 29.5%
 - Satisfactory - 31.1%**
 - Deficient - 14.8%

5. Avoidance of sexual, racial and ethnic bias: 120 responses
 - Excellent - 36.7%**
 - Good - 20.8%
 - Satisfactory - 24.2%
 - Deficient - 18.3%

Judicial Temperament

1. Judicial temperament and demeanor in general: 122 responses
 - Excellent - 41.8%**
 - Good - 34.4%
 - Satisfactory - 16.4%
 - Deficient - 7.4%

2. Courtesy to litigants and witnesses: 122 responses
 - Excellent - 50.8%**
 - Good - 27.9%
 - Satisfactory - 18%
 - Deficient - 3.3%

3. Courtesy to lawyers: 122 responses
 - Excellent - 51.6%**
 - Good - 27.9%
 - Satisfactory - 17.2%%
 - Deficient - 3.3%

Industry and Promptness

1. Promptness in making judicial decisions: 122 responses
 - Excellent - 28.7%
 - Good - 48.4%**
 - Satisfactory - 16.4%
 - Deficient - 6.6%

2. Punctuality and diligence: 121 responses

Excellent - 34.7%

Good - 46.3%

Satisfactory - 13.2%

Deficient - 5.8%

3. Fair and efficient trial management and docket control: 121 responses

Excellent - 33.9%

Good - 43.8%

Satisfactory - 16.5%

Deficient - 5.8%

Commissioner Derrick Williams

*no longer with the Workers' Compensation Commission

Legal Skills

1. Knowledge and application of rule of evidence and procedural law: 126 responses

Excellent - 71.4%

Good - 20.6%

Satisfactory - 7.9%

Deficient - 0%

2. Knowledge and application of substantive law: 125 responses

Excellent - 72%

Good - 20%

Satisfactory - 8%

Deficient - 0%

3. Fair and effective settlement skills: 123 responses

Excellent - 68.3%

Good - 23.6%

Satisfactory - 7.3%

Deficient - .8%

Impartiality

1. Absence of favoritism toward Claimant: 126 responses

Excellent - 61.9%

Good - 25.4%

Satisfactory - 12.7%

Deficient - 0%

2. Absence of favoritism toward Defendants: 125 responses

Excellent - 60%

Good - 24%

Satisfactory - 12%

Deficient - 4%

3. Not influenced by identities of lawyer: 125 responses

Excellent - 56.8%

Good - 25.6%

Satisfactory - 14.4.%
Deficient - 3.2%

4. Not influenced by identities of litigants: 124 responses

Excellent - 67.6%

Good - 20.2%

Satisfactory - 11.3%

Deficient - .8%

5. Avoidance of sexual, racial and ethnic bias: 124 responses

Excellent - 75%

Good - 14.5%

Satisfactory - 10.5%

Deficient - 0%

Judicial Temperament

1. Judicial temperament and demeanor in general: 126 responses

Excellent - 85.7%

Good - 11.9%

Satisfactory - 2.4%

Deficient - 0%

2. Courtesy to litigants and witnesses: 125 responses

Excellent - 85.6%

Good - 12.8%

Satisfactory - 1.6%

Deficient - 0%

3. Courtesy to lawyers: 123 responses

Excellent - 85.4%

Good - 13%

Satisfactory - 1.6%

Deficient - 0%

Industry and Promptness

1. Promptness in making judicial decisions: 126 responses

Excellent - 69.8%

Good - 24.6%

Satisfactory - 5.6%
Deficient – 0%

2. Punctuality and diligence: 125 responses

Excellent - 75.2%
Good - 20.8%
Satisfactory - 4%
Deficient - 0%

3. Fair and efficient trial management and docket control: 124 responses

Excellent - 77.4%
Good - 17.7%
Satisfactory - 4.8%
Deficient – 0%